

## REVIEWS

*The Cambridge Companion to Brass Instruments*, ed. Trevor Herbert and John Wallace. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1997. Hardback (ISBN 0-521-56343-7) and paperback (ISBN 0-521-56522-7).

Contents:

Lip-vibrated instruments of the ancient and non-western world *Margaret Sarkissian*

How brass instruments work *Arnold Myers*

Design, technology and manufacture before 1800 *Robert Barclay*

Brass instruments in art music in the Middle Ages *Keith Polk*

The cornett *Bruce Dickey*

“Sackbut”: the early trombone *Trevor Herbert*

The trumpet before 1800 *Edward H. Tarr*

The horn in the Baroque and Classical periods *Thomas Hiebert*

Design, technology and manufacture since 1800 *Arnold Myers*

Keyed brass *Ralph T. Dudgeon*

The low brass *Clifford Bevan*

Brass in the modern orchestra *Simon Wills*

Brass bands and other vernacular brass traditions *Trevor Herbert*

Playing, learning and teaching brass *Ralph T. Dudgeon, Phillip Eastop, Trevor Herbert and John Wallace*

The post-classical horn *Robert Evans*

Jazz, improvisation and brass *Roger T. Dean*

Brass solo and chamber music from 1800 *John Wallace*

Frontiers or byways? Brass instruments in avant-garde music *Simon Wills*

As one can see from the contents above, the *Cambridge Companion* contains a very broad survey of the field of brass instruments, with contributions from some of the finest scholars and performers on brass instruments from the United Kingdom and America. The first priority of the volume is to provide a broad overview of the family of brass instruments, with specific details and roles of individual instruments, their evolution, playing techniques and repertoire, handled discretely yet with an eye toward the development of the family as a whole. This volume is an excellent resource for anyone with minimal knowledge of music. And while one might quibble with individual authors about priorities and the importance of various figures and developments (and in some cases, awareness of recent research), the articles themselves provide balanced views of the subjects at hand. All of the articles are top-notch, with several special highlights.

Margaret Sarkissian's opening article on ancient and non-Western instruments is a welcome breath of fresh air, and she provides insight into the daunting problem of classifying lip-blown instruments, and the frustrating dependence on secondary and in some cases very old resources for information in this area. She addresses geographic distribution,

symbolism, and ritual, using a wide range of examples, to present a very effective survey (and the inherent problems) of this area of study. Arnold Myers' description of how brass instruments work is one of the most concise I have ever read. Another highlight is Robert Barclay's essay on pre-1800 materials and manufacturing of brass instruments. The combination of historical information and perspective with real-life experience that he offers makes for very enlightening reading about the art and the craft of instrument-making during that time.

Keith Polk's article takes the reader from the earliest evidence of ritual uses of trumpets in the Middle Ages to the advent of slide technology, ensemble instrumentation, and repertoire including brass instruments in the fifteenth century. Polk presents a clear outline this evolution, acknowledging along the way several debates among scholars regarding various details of instrument uses and development. The result is a clear and concise overview that encourages and enables the reader to look further into issues of interest. Similarly, Bruce Dickey traces a brief history of the cornett, from its earliest ancestor, the animal horn with holes, through its heyday in the seventeenth century, to its eventual decline in the eighteenth. His overview of repertoire, instruction, and usage is informative and even-handed.

Trevor Herbert takes a different but no less balanced approach to the Renaissance sackbut, looking at the etymology of the term and early research (and myths) about the instrument. He then moves on to discuss physical and musical characteristics, idioms and styles, centers of employment, and performing practices to the middle of the eighteenth century—an excellent, well-rounded article. Edward Tarr presents highlights of the trumpet's development in Western art music from 1500-1800, including examples of military uses, trumpet ensemble music, guilds, and how players and composers contributed to the integration of the trumpet into art music during this period. Tarr does an excellent job of addressing contexts, repertoire, performing practices, and practical concerns involving playing techniques and instruments in such a small space. Of special value and interest to brass players (and listeners as well) is Tarr's advice on performance styles, including intonation, articulation, and sound (among others).

Thomas Hiebert does a similarly excellent job of addressing the development and inclusion of the horn in art music from 1700 to the early nineteenth century. Hiebert traces the horn's development from its late seventeenth-century associations with the hunt through its inclusion in early eighteenth-century opera orchestras and its quick evolution to style characteristics similar to those of the trumpet, to the discovery of hand-stopping and additional improvements in construction and pedagogy that had profound effects on solo and orchestral horn writing and playing by the early 1800s.

Arnold Myers' description of the impact of various technological and manufacturing developments is another highlight of this volume. From obvious developments, such as the development of valve technology, to more subtle forces, such as factory production and such technical advances as electroplating, Myers' contribution, much like Barclay's, brings brass instruments into a more "real-life" perspective. Especially enlightening to players are the descriptions of various valve systems, necessarily short but quite informative. Ralph Dudgeon's article on keyed brass is a well-placed follow-up to Myers' essay, and outlines

the chronology of how keys were applied to brass instruments and subsequently received by players, composers and audiences. After a discussion of early developments, Dudgeon provides longer sections on the keyed bugle and ophicleide, which discuss makers, players and repertoire to the mid-nineteenth century, as well as recent revivals.

Clifford Bevan's discussion of low-brass instruments begins with the serpent, continues through the ophicleide and early tuba, and proceeds to twentieth-century developments and influences of players and composers on the tuba and its repertoire. This very enlightening article offers clear evidence and perspective on these earliest low brass instruments, including some comparisons of dimensions, clarification of terminology, and musical context and application of the instruments. Bevan also includes information about the *cimbasso* and saxhorn (in a low brass context), which will inevitably clear up wide-ranging confusion about what these instruments actually are and how they participated in music at the time they were used.

Trombonist Simon Wills takes on the daunting task of tracing the role of brass instruments in the "modern" orchestra (eighteenth century to the present), and despite long odds (in less than twenty pages!), does a fine job of addressing primary forces and developments. Experts in various areas might feel shortchanged in terms of their favorites, but Wills' even-handedness is appreciated. Of particular interest are Wills' comments regarding the current state of orchestral playing and issues of modern technology, attitudes, and the role of historical performance in re-sensitizing performers to music from various periods and composers. Trevor Herbert's ensuing article on brass bands and vernacular traditions is another breath of fresh air in this volume. He provides a wide-ranging discussion of brass bands in many different cultures, appropriately focusing on British traditions, but also covering various adaptations in Africa and elsewhere, including early jazz bands in America. The following collective effort to outline the history and technical issues of brass pedagogy provides many examples of methods, technical manuals, and other means (including "learning by osmosis"). The article also provides useful descriptions of physical factors involved in sound production (e.g., embouchure), breathing (e.g., the diaphragm, Alexander Technique, glottis, tongue), hands, and fingers.

Robert Evans' article on the horn after 1800 focuses on the early evolution of writing for the horn, with emphasis on certain technological developments (i.e., different uses of valves) and musical preferences (e.g., frequent use of programmatic hunting horn style and the "modern" development of the "long-line" solo). He also discusses how later in our own century, writing for the instrument was influenced more by specific players. Though the scope and depth of this article left me wanting more substance and clarification, the approach and examples provided support his arguments well. Roger Dean's essay on brass instruments in jazz and other improvisatory forms is yet another happy addition to this collection. Dean provides an overview of developments and roles of brass instruments in jazz, and then discusses techniques of "individualizing" and "collectivizing" used by different players toward different goals. All techniques, whether used to separate or blend, contribute to style and expression, and Dean uses Miles Davis as an example of how brass instruments can be used to very different ends, even by the same player. Dean also presents

a nice list of important players, including (finally) some tubists and hornists.

John Wallace's article on solo and chamber music since 1800 also undertakes a difficult task. He traces developments in solo and chamber repertoire (both in art and popular musics) to the present day, including performers, composers, and compositions that have influenced how these genres have evolved. Of particular interest is his inclusion of music for the orchestral brass choir, and discussions of the progress in repertoire for individual instruments and ensembles, in both serious and lighter veins. Finally, Simon Wills' survey of brass instruments in avant-garde music is another special contribution to this volume. Wills looks at various extended techniques called for in solo pieces as well as orchestral scores in an effort to summarize how the instruments have been used in non-traditional ways. He raises an interesting point: that while composers (and composer/performers) have gone to great lengths to discover new sounds and techniques, they have chosen to stay with traditional instruments, making little use of more "exotic" instruments such as the alto trombone, Wagner tuba, bass trumpet, and even the cornet, not to mention historical instruments. He suggests that perhaps we have not traveled as far as we think we have, and perhaps there is much more to be discovered, mulled over, and created. Interesting food for thought....

This volume makes efficient use of tables, examples and pictures, which coupled with the friendly, informative language, make it an extremely useful and engaging book. The choice of authors, particularly from the standpoint of language toward the overall goal, is very sensitive and appropriate. One could take issue with certain missing or underdeveloped subjects, for example, in areas of American brass playing (e.g., Civil War band music), various developments in France throughout the nineteenth century (e.g., more on the work of Sax, among others), and more specific details on activities and developments outside of the western European mainstream, but frankly, in this context, it isn't worth the trouble and energy. It is impossible to be all things to all people, and the *Cambridge Companion* does exactly what it sets out to do: it provides a comprehensive (not exhaustive) reference volume on the subject of brass instruments as a family. The editors and authors alike are to be congratulated for the balance of important scholarship and user-friendly language they have created. This book is valuable to brass enthusiasts of all persuasions.

Jeffrey Snedeker

*Talks with Bandsmen* by Algernon S. Rose, with a new introduction by Arnold Myers. London: Tony Bingham, 1995. 420 pp. Facsimile of London 1895 edition. ISBN 0 946113 06 8. Price £20. Available direct from the publisher only, at 11 Pond St., London, NW3 2PN, UK.

During the Second World War, a bomb fell on part of the book depositories of the British Library. It was a direct hit (so I am told) on books published about brass bands in the

Victorian period. I am sure that this bombing was not strategic, but it has perplexed me greatly over the years. It has been difficult enough to find out that such publications ever existed, but the elation of discovering them in the British Library catalogues, only to be told that the volume concerned is “Lost,” has sometimes been hard to bear.

Fortunately, copies of one such book survive in several places, and I am convinced that it is one of the most important of its type. Algernon Rose was a well-educated, widely traveled, urbane, and eclectic man of letters. He attended school in England and went on to study in Germany and Switzerland. Like his grandfather, father and brother, Rose worked for Broadwood, the largest British piano manufacturer. His father and brother actually became directors of the company. He acted as the concertmaster for the tour of Australia by Sir Charles and Lady Halle that was sponsored by Broadwood. Rose was apparently charged with promoting the sale of the company’s instruments. Some time later he left Broadwood. He was, according to a letter to his brother, “ejected and penniless,” and spent his time working as a journalist and then as secretary to The Authors’ Club in London. He died in London in 1934 at the age of 75.

*Talks with Bandsmen* has its origin in a series of eight lectures given to the brass band which was made up of employees of the Broadwood piano factory. A couple of other chapters were later added for the publication of the *Talks* in 1895. It is not clear how and why Rose acquired a knowledge of the subject, for though a London bias is evident when he describes manufacturing, the book hints that he had gained a wider understanding, not just of brass bands, but of their place in the broader context of the music-making of his time though a work of his was included in the Sousa Band repertory in the 1890’s. It is certainly a book which could only have been written after observation as well as research of its subject.

Rose is particularly interesting on instrument manufacture and production—especially in the London factories. He cites sixteen makers of whom he claims first-hand knowledge. His accounts of provincial makers is less detailed, but nevertheless useful. Much of what he has to say is understandably didactic. His talks were, after all (as Arnold Myers, who, commendably, traced the origins of the *Talks*, points out) aimed at piano makers who probably had little knowledge of other instruments. He writes of the history of instruments, and indeed of music and musical life in general. Some of what he has to say is dubious, but equally, he displays a wide understanding of the musical life of his time. He espouses the value of good British-made instruments, a message which would have been well received at Broadwood, as they were facing up to German competition.

Especially interesting, and to my mind extremely revealing, is his chapter entitled “How to Form a Brass Band.” Whether this section represents Rose’s observations of best practice, or his own recipe for success, is not known; but it should provide material for cultural historians as well as musicians. The unwitting testimony it provides of the assumed virtues of deference, discipline and self-improvement in Victorian culture shines through like a beacon.

There is, of course, the issue of how much of what Rose says is true, accurate, and a reliable representation of Victorian practice as a whole. Much of the historical material is

specious. He gives three or four different and contradictory roots for the origins of the brass band movement, and none of them are entirely correct, and his florid and liberal references to the classics should not be subjected to too much scrutiny. His prose is always colorful, interesting and often absorbing, but it does not disguise the fact that he was well-read. He attended Galpin's lectures and seems to display the type of familiarity with leading musical figures of his day—such as Hubert Parry, the first director of The Royal College of Music, and W. C. Mcfarren, a professor at the Royal Academy of Music and brother of the more famous composer, Sir George Mcfarren—which could only have been gained through first-hand acquaintance with them.

The importance of Rose to brass band history is that he seems to have been more firmly middle-class, and more a part of the dominant musical establishment, than anyone else who wrote extensively about the subject. He seems to have been detached from the brass band movement, but equally, he appears to speak (for most of the time) with a genuine authority. He hardly sways from an overtly systematic account of his subject, and his own index for the book is extraordinarily detailed and helpful. Any obvious limitations are those to which Rose himself admits, (in a subsequent publication he quotes one critic of *Talks* who said, "a shoemaker should stick to his last"). But, in any case, a primary source on Victorian music of this size, scope and character would have to be almost totally devoid of factual accuracy to be anything less than valuable, and such is most definitely not the case. Compared to other popular books about music written at this time—for example, H. R. Haweis's notoriously eccentric, appallingly idiosyncratic, but phenomenally successful *Music and Morals* (which ran to twenty-one editions between 1871 and 1906)—Rose's *Talks* is a model of information and common sense. Above all, Rose comes over as a person with acute powers of observation, a lucid style of writing and an urbane, eclectic Victorian whose feet were (more or less) firmly on the ground.

This edition is produced in the form of a totally clear paperback facsimile. All the features of the original publication are retained, including the trades advertisements, which are important sources in their own right. Arnold Myers provides a brief, lucid, helpful and entirely reliable introduction, which places Rose, his spheres of interest, and the brass band movement as a whole, in context. Much of the contextual material about the provenance of the book is new. He deserves the gratitude of anyone interested in the history of brass bands, as does the publisher, Tony Bingham. This is an extremely important printed primary source for this subject. It is hard to overstate how helpful it is to have it available in this form.

*Giovanni Gabrieli (ca. 1555-1612): A Thematic Catalogue of his Music with a Guide to the Source Materials and Translations of his Vocal Texts*, by Richard Charteris. Thematic Catalogues, no. 20. Stuyvesant, NY: Pendragon Press, 1996. ISBN 0-944193-66-1. 19 plates. 597 + xxvi pages.

One reason an overworked scholar might welcome the apocalypse is that, presumably, on

that day, bibliographical work will be done. The ongoing growth and cataloguing of libraries, the unearthing of books and manuscripts, and increasingly meticulous documentation of all of this conspire to make catalogues of prints, manuscripts, and creative works outdated from the moment of their appearance. Nevertheless, catalogues occasionally appear that so successfully approach comprehensiveness and so thoroughly incorporate recent research that they acquire an authority that makes them the standard for many years to some. Richard Charteris' catalogue of the works of Giovanni Gabrieli is such a work.

Charteris has distinguished himself as one of the foremost experts on the works of Gabrieli through numerous articles on the composer, discovery of over forty new compositions by Gabrieli and over 160 new manuscript sources of his work, collaboration on recorded performances of the works, and completion and revision of the Giovanni Gabrieli *Opera Omnia* edition (in progress). Charteris' catalogue of Gabrieli's works represents the accumulated fruit of all these varied researches and brings Gabrieli scholarship to a new level; and his assignment of C-numbers to the works themselves is, perhaps, a permissible response to the definitiveness of this work.

The book is copiously cross-referenced. After the usual Preface, Introduction, Acknowledgments, and lists of Illustrations and Abbreviations begins the catalogue of the vocal works. The first three chapters cover the motets of *Concerti di Andrea et di Gio: Gabrieli* (Venice, 1587), *Sacrae Symphoniae* (Venice, 1597), and *Symphoniae Sacrae* (Venice, 1615), respectively. Chapters four and five cover madrigals and motets, respectively, in printed anthologies and manuscripts. Chapter six covers incomplete motets and miscellaneous works. Chapters seven through nine cover the instrumental works: first, ensemble works from *Sacrae Symphoniae*, printed anthologies, and manuscripts; then those from *Canzoni et sonate* (Venice, 1615), and finally, keyboard works. Chapter ten covers contrafacta, chapter eleven, doubtful works, and chapter twelve, spurious works. In general, works from printed sources appear in the prints' order, and manuscript works are ordered alphabetically. This catalogue completes the core of the book to page 354. The remaining 240 pages include appendices of: I) lost works and sources, II) early prints, III) manuscript sources, IV) translations of dedications, V) modern editions, VI) concordance with Kenton's index, VII) discography, VIII) facsimiles, and IX) bibliography, as well as indexes of Gabrieli's works by: I) title, II) catalogue number, III) textual origin and liturgical use, and a fourth index of names.

In the catalogue, each entry receives a title, an incipit of the opening voice, and source lists of early (pre-1700) prints, manuscript sources, and modern (post-1700) editions. Each entry also has a list of references in previous indexes, the text in the original language and English, with discussion of its origin, and commentary on relevant Gabrieli scholarship. The copious documentation in each entry makes the use of abbreviations absolutely essential and fully justifies the abbreviation list in the introduction and the appendices of early prints (II), manuscript sources (III), and bibliography (IX) (which includes modern editions). Entries in the discography (Appendix VII) are also abbreviated; and, although these items do not appear in the individual work entries in the catalogue proper, the discography concludes with a complete list of all recordings by musical work, in order, including those

works which have not yet been recorded.

One additional list, of considerable interest, appears in the preface. Here the author has evaluated the claims to all the known and questionable students of Gabrieli, based on his comprehensive knowledge of the literature.

The book is the most complete catalogue to date of Gabrieli's work. It is as inclusive as possible at this time; and the author, in his wisdom, has left gaps in the C-number series to accommodate future discoveries. His handling of related literature appears comprehensive to an almost overwhelming degree, and the extensive cross-referenced lists make it possible to answer practically any imaginable question, beginning anywhere in the book's information tree. Although the extensive use of abbreviations impedes casual reading of the catalogue, it is inconceivable that this amount of information could have been conveyed in any other way. Such abbreviation is a convention of such catalogues; in any case, Charteris uses standard RISM abbreviations for libraries and early prints, and his other abbreviations follow scholarly conventions, so the work is as approachable as possible.

Nevertheless, it has been said that no book is perfect, and Charteris' is no exception. In view of the difficulty of editing a work as concentrated as this one, the quality of proofreading is impressive, though occasional problems do catch the eye. The most significant is the author's choice to present only one voice's incipit for non-keyboard works—no doubt for reasons of space. While this certainly suffices for the identification of complete works, it is not difficult to envision being hampered in the identification of a set of parts that happens to lack the opening voice. There are also a few typographical errors. Gabrieli's name receives two Ls on the cover, and one throughout the rest of the book. There are occasional, if rare, absent diacritical marks in foreign words. One which comes to mind is that the L in the first name of the Polish composer Mikotaj Zielenski should have a slash through it (xiii). Some problems cannot be blamed on the author or editor. More variation of typeface and use of closer line spacing in some sections would have allowed more concentration of information while preserving or even enhancing the accessibility of information, as well as reducing the volume's size. And although an author cannot be blamed for not including information that became available only when the book was in press, Giulio Ongaro's discovery of Giovanni's family name prior to his adoption of his uncle's certainly merits inclusion in a future edition or addendum.

But these flaws are so slight as to be almost insignificant in the face of the great scholarly advance represented by this book. At last, and thanks to Richard Charteris, we have as complete a catalogue of Giovanni Gabrieli's works as is possible at this time. And the catalogue has been done right, with great attention to detail, comprehensive documentation, liberal cross-referencing and indexing, and thorough critical evaluation. This catalogue may not last until the apocalypse, but it will serve us well for many years in that direction.

Gary Towne

*Antique Brass Wind Instruments Identification and Value Guide*, by Peter H. Adams. Atglen, PA: Schiffer Publishing Ltd., 1998. 176 pp.: c. 100 pages of musical instrument catalog illustrations. ISBN 0-7643-0027-X. \$29.95

*Antique Brass Wind Instruments* has a beautiful cover, excellent paper and a binding that appears to be solid and durable. It includes some good information, but the average aspiring collector for whom the book is written will have a hard time separating what is true from the overwhelming wealth of misinformation. If you are interested in the history of brass instruments in the United States, read the references cited, not what the author has written. For example, his description of the Saxhorn as a single instrument that: “. . . looks much like the B flat tenor horn offered by Isaac Fiske (Number 10) found in this book”, his explanation about dealing with non-standard pitches: “Brass instruments only partly overcame this problem with crooks and shanks. Crooks and shanks, however, were applied to brass instruments mostly to change an instrument’s pitch by a semitone,” or his definition of a cornet: “a 19th century predecessor of the trumpet, . . .”

Reprints of catalogs of the period are welcome except that several pages are mislabeled, illustrations are rearranged and instruments are renamed according to modern collectors’ usage. The E flat tenor instruments in the 1868 Fiske and 1879 D.C. Hall catalogs are renamed “Altos” rather than explain that in bands up through the Civil War what is called today an E flat alto was used for the tenor voice of the band and was properly called an E flat tenor. The original terms used in the Fiske catalog were “Tenor (or alto)” reflecting the change taking place then. Although substituting the modern term is mentioned for the Hall catalog, the reader is not informed about changes to the Fiske catalog. Throughout the catalogs instruments are called “Alto Horn,” “Tenor Horn,” or “Bass Horn” adding modern confusion to 19th century terminology. The catalogs say simply “Alto,” “Tenor,” “Baritone,” “Bass,” and “Contrabass,” and if anything, imply that they are Saxhorns not horns. There is also no reason to change the name of D.C. Hall’s Stölzel valved cornet to corneopan.

In regard to the period covered, the author states that, “This book is limited to brass wind instruments constructed between 1869 and 1920. 1869 is the date of the earliest trade catalog that could be located for a U.S. manufacturer of brass musical instruments.” Many catalogs are available before 1869, even an 1868 Fiske catalog he includes. Those I know of are 1861 Fiske, 1864 Slater, 1865 Foote, and 1867 Schreiber. The latter contains a unique and highly collectible American design patented by Schreiber in 1867 that Adams has omitted entirely even though it was certainly produced as late as 1869.

Some of the things included in a book limited to brass instruments 1869-1920 are quite surprising: the history section has more to do with strings and pianos than with brasses; aluminum smelting is hardly germane to the subject; signal horns and Zophones are interesting, but only so that they are not mistaken for brass instruments; Franciolini’s forgeries are also interesting, but had little to do with brass instruments of the period.

There are also omissions worth comment. The list of makers (which includes dealers and importers) has a number of listings outside the time period 1869-1920, but does not

include the following who definitely worked during the period, some of them discussed elsewhere in the book.

Buescher, Elkhart, IN 1894-1950  
 D.C. Hall & Hall & Quinby, Boston, MA 1862-1880  
 John Heald, Springfield, MA 1887-1927  
 Daniel Hess, New York, NY 1860-1886  
 Brau C. Keefer, Williamsport, PA 1909-1942  
 Henry W. Moennig, New York, NY 1857-1883  
 Louis Schreiber, New York, NY 1858-1883  
 Ernst Seltmann, Philadelphia, PA 1860-1906  
 Christian R. Stark, New York, NY 1856-1880

In the list of resources there is no listing for Tim Holmes of A & R Music, Lincoln Park, MI whose restoration and reproduction work should be mentioned along with that of Robb Stewart. Ralph Dudgeon's book, *The Keyed Bugle*, Metuchen, NJ: The Scarecrow Press, Inc., 1993 deserves mention as well as his dissertation.

Pricing antiques is always a very difficult matter, but the "Subjective Price List," despite Adams many cautions, is irregular. After looking through the Distin, Foote, Hall, and Lyon & Healy catalog illustrations it is disappointing not to find any of their instruments in the price list except a double bell euphonium by Lyon & Healy. This, even though current market value prices are given with many of the catalog illustrations. It seems unusual also to include a bass horn, keyed bugles, ophicleides, keyed trumpets, natural horns, and a natural trumpet, all from earlier periods. On the other hand over 100 instruments in the list are dated after 1930 and another 16 or so date from after 1980! The list is also skewed by the inclusion of about 75 Martin Bros. instruments, many with high prices. Although he calls attention to this irregularity, he does not explain it. It would also seem prudent to exclude unusual and one-of-a-kind sales that would have no bearing on other sales and might even be private knowledge, yet some of these are included.

Peter Adams did a disservice to his readers when he didn't do his homework. Schiffer Publishing Ltd. let Peter Adams and his potential readers down when they did not provide a good editor with the discipline to demand a focus on the subject and time period, substantiation or elimination of questionable statements, reasonable clarity of expression, some semblance of logic, and a tolerable level of errors.

**Robert E Leiason**