

## KEYED BUGLE METHOD BOOKS: DOCUMENTS OF TRANSITION IN 19TH-CENTURY BRASS INSTRUMENT PERFORMANCE PRACTICE AND AESTHETICS IN ENGLAND

Ralph Dudgeon

The 19th century provided changing audiences, increased amateur involvement in bands, new instrument design and the availability of economical printing, all of which contributed to a wealth of instructional material. The publishing activity of this era represents a real knowledge explosion when compared with the sparse dissemination of earlier trumpet methods.<sup>1</sup> This article is a brief appraisal of the impact of the methods for the English slide trumpet, the keyed bugle and the corneopane and the kinds of changes that they brought to soprano brass performance in the 19th century. I was able to locate 47 keyed bugle method books ranging from 1810 to 1861 for my 1987 publication, *The Keyed Bugler's Companion*.<sup>2</sup> I am grateful to Al Rice, who recently added a dozen more titles to my list as a result of a similar study of Italian and German sources. It is likely that there are more. A full inventory of this type of instruction material remains for future researchers.

As a group, the books show a merger of two performance traditions. Some of the earlier books were written by trumpeters, who were doubling on the prototype instruments and show the influence of natural trumpet playing traditions and techniques that date from the Baroque era. Other authors, who described new instruments like the keyed bugle and corneopane, show new radical leanings toward a fluid, legato style more in keeping with the harmonic and melodic adventures of the Romantic era and more idiomatic for the new instruments. This second generation devoted its attention to the keyed bugle with little mention of the natural instrument or its repertoire. The current evidence strongly suggests that it was this generation of writers (and their students) that made a break with the older trumpet traditions and paved the way for the corneopane and the cornet literature that dominated the rest of the 19th century.

---

1. There are only a handful of documents before 1800 that address the pedagogical aspects of the trumpeter's art. Scott Sorensen's article "Printed Trumpet Instruction to 1835" in the September, 1987, issue of the *International Trumpet Guild Journal* provides us with a catalog of these early works. Instructions for the natural instruments were also published in the 19th century due to the instrument's continued ceremonial and military use as well as its employment in the older orchestral and operatic repertoire.

2. Ralph T. Dudgeon, *The Keyed Bugler's Companion*, 2nd edition (Homer, N.Y.; Spring Tree Enterprises, 1987). Rice's addenda as well as other newly located items will be included in the next edition.

The bulk of the evidence of transition can be found in the early methods written between 1813 and 1835. I have elected to limit the present discussion to the books produced by Hyde<sup>3</sup> and Harper<sup>4</sup> (whose methods were designed for both the slide trumpet and the keyed bugle) and contrast them to the work of Logier<sup>5</sup> (who was a major influence on English and American authors of keyed bugle tutors). Finally, I will contrast Hyde, Harper and Logier with Macfarlane's cornopean tutor,<sup>6</sup> which ushers in the modern period of cornet playing that was summarized and synthesized by Arban a few years later. There were other good methods from the list of more than 60 mentioned above, but

3. John (James?) Hyde, *A New and Complete Preceptor for the Royal Kent or Keyed Bugle, to which is added, A Choice Selection of Duets, With Bass Accompaniment. Some Remarks on the Chromatic Trumpet and Marches for 3 Trumpets. It also contains the Rifle Bugle Duty, as used by the 95th Regt. and all Corps. of Light Infantry, With the Cavalry Duty Contained in the Author's former Publications as ordered to be the standing Regulation by H.R.H. the Duke of York, Commander in Chief.* (London: J. Balls, c. 1818) 45pp. This book is undated, but Hyde mentions in the preface that he wrote it 20 years after his first book, which was published in 1798.

4. Thomas Harper Sr., *Instructions for the Trumpet With the use of the Chromatic Slide, Also the Russian valve Trumpet, the Cornet a Pistons or Small Stop Trumpet and the Keyed Bugle, In which Rudiments of Music and the Various Scales are clearly explained in a Series of Examples, Preludes, Lessons, Solos, Duets, etc. for each Instrument, Composed, Arranged, and Dedicated to the Right Honorable General Lord Hill Commander in Chief By Thomas Harper.* (London: Cramer, Addson & Beale Music Publishers 1835) 68 pp. British Library b. 133, 1-2. Second Edition (London: By the Author, 1837), Facsimile reprint of the Second Edition with commentary on the life of Harper by John Webb and Scott Sorensen. Forward by John Webb (Homer, N.Y.: Spring Tree Enterprises 1988) 86 pp. All Ibid. citations refer to the facsimile ed.

5. John Bernard Logier, *Logier's Instructions to the Art of Playing the Royal Kent Bugle, Illustrated with Appropriate Examples of Fingering. Also General Rules for Acquiring a Good Embouchure, to Which are Prefixed Forty-two Lessons in Various Keys, Calculated to Facilitate the Improvement of the Pupil on This Curious and Delightful Instrument.* (Dublin: Logier's Music Saloon, 1813) 31pp; Second edition (Clementi & Co., 1823); Third edition (London: R. Cocks, c. 1838). A copy of the first edition has not been located. All references are to the second 1823 edition located in the British Museum g. 353z. (z)

6. G. Macfarlane, *The Cornopean Instructor, Containing the Elementary principles of Music The best method of acquiring the proper Embouchure Airs from the Most Favorite Operas, with Exercises and Preludes in Various Keys, also Duets for 2 Cornopeans To which is added an Appendix Showing how to transpose Music for the Cornopean to accompany the Piano Forte in every Key, the whole Most Respectfully Dedicated to His Pupils.* 23rd revised edition (London: Kohler & Son, nd) 46pp. Kohler & Son were at 35 Henrietta St., Covent Garden, the address given on the title page of the 23rd edition, from 1834 to 1881. This copy is in my collection. Judging from the number of editions, it must have been a popular book. Note the dedication to his pupils, rather than a military figure.

the works of Harper, Logier and Macfarlane epitomize the three stages of transition in England. The slide instrument was not favored outside England and its regional specificity will color the conclusions arrived at here to apply primarily to England. Other social, technological, economic and musical conditions were at play on the Continent and in the United States and should be the subject of a later expanded paper. The development of valved instruments ran parallel to the keyed bugle methods under discussion. Valve patents start eight years after the keyed bugle's invention in 1810 and both keyed and valved instruments were slow to be admitted into ensembles until they began to flourish in the 1820s. In other words, natural, slide, keyed and valved brasses coexisted in many bands and orchestras for 20 or 30 years. Cross-fertilization was inevitable. Cornopean methods may have even influenced some of the later brass books.

The situation becomes more complex when the continuing use of the keyed trumpet is brought into the picture. Harper was aware of the instrument, but surprisingly omits it from his catholic discussion of the soprano brass in his book. Grudgingly, he gives it in a brief footnote in his *Instructions*.<sup>7</sup> Although the keyed trumpet was the beneficiary of the major concertos of Haydn and Hummel, it was not used much in England except by visiting German or Italian musicians. Keyed bugles were more successful as instruments of popular culture and played a greater role in the quest for a practical chromatic soprano brass instrument.

John Hyde (fl. 1789-1827) is the first to give instructions for the slide trumpet in his 1798 publication, *A New and Complete Preceptor for the Trumpet & Bugle Horn...*<sup>8</sup> His next book, written 20 years later, was entitled *A New and Complete Preceptor for the Keyed Bugle*.<sup>9</sup> Hyde was the principal trumpet at the Opera and King's Concerts of Ancient Music in London for 30 years. Both books are dedicated to the Duke of York and include regulation military calls as well as the usual exercises, duets and tunes. The military provided a much better market for trumpet instruction books than the small number of civilian professional trumpeters who were beyond the type of instruction provided by the average 19th century tutor and who often kept private notebooks of difficult passages and excerpts for practice. The keyed bugle's link to the military is strengthened by the illustration of two keyed bugles framing a large Hanoverian-type

7. Harper Sr., *Instructions*, p. 13.

8. John (James?) Hyde, *A New and Complete Preceptor for the Trumpet & Bugle Horn. With the Whole of the Cavalry Duty as approved of and ordered by His Royal Highness the Duke of York, Commander in Chief. To which is added a Selection of Airs, Marches & Quick Steps for Three Trumpeters, A Scale for the Chromatic Trumpet, With Airs Adapted for it, And a Collection of Bugle Horn Duets, With the Light Infantry Duty* (London: Whitaker & Compys' Warehouse, c. 1798), 54pp. Brit. Lib. b.133, 1-2.

9. Hyde, *A New and Complete Preceptor for the Royal Kent or Keyed Bugle...* (1818 ed.).

bugle on the title page. In his book, Hyde comments on the choice of mouthpiece, embouchure, articulation and practice procedures. His language is simple and direct and reflects a performer's approach. Hyde advocates the use of a traditional semi-hemispherical cup mouthpiece and adds that the rims of various mouthpieces when playing both trumpets and keyed bugles should be the same.

Perhaps the most important method book for soprano brass in the early 19th century is Thomas Harper Senior's *Instructions for the Trumpet, With Use of the Chromatic Slide, Also the Russian Valve Trumpet, and the Keyed Bugle...* The book was published in 1835, with a second edition in 1837, when Harper was at the height of his playing career and the developing valved and keyed instruments were competing on equal ground. Thomas Harper was the leading English slide trumpeter of his day. Understandably, the major part of his method deals with the slide trumpet. Illustrations for the method were drawn on stone by H. Barraud. The portrait of Harper, the beautiful plates of the instruments and a detailed cut-away drawing of a trumpet mouthpiece, help make this a significant work. In his directions, Harper states that the primary use of the slide is to correct the intonation of the written  $f^1$  and  $a^1$  (above the staff), and that the slide makes it possible to sound a semitone below any note of the natural trumpet's harmonic series. He also states that the written  $d$  and  $f$  (above middle  $c$ ) will not be able to sound in tune, as indeed they do not on surviving instruments and copies of his trumpet made by John Webb. With that said, he proceeds to immediately introduce progressively more difficult exercises and tunes that employ the troublesome  $f$  and  $d$ .<sup>10</sup>

Harper's method material for the use of the slide indicates that he was pushing the envelope of what the instrument could play (Ex. 1). Harper built his reputation through high-quality performances of trumpet obbligato parts like "The trumpet shall sound" from *Messiah* and "Let the bright seraphim" from *Samson*. By 1820, Harper had replaced Hyde as the principal trumpet in most of the major festival orchestras. He made a career out of playing works originally composed for the natural trumpet on his slide instrument. Perhaps more telling than the selections in his tutor, is the idiomatic use of the slide trumpet in an obbligato part that Harper played in Henry Bishop's "Thine For Ever"<sup>11</sup> (Ex. 2). Harper made this arrangement for one of his many concert engagements with the soprano Clara Novello. In it, Harper uses the slide tones sparingly. The similarity to "The trumpet shall sound" is obvious. Both are arias with similar phrase structures. The arrangement probably offered Harper program variety by providing a piece that was different from his warhorses, but not so different as to disappoint the

---

10. The intonation problems of written  $d$  and  $f$  (these notes are sharp) increase as crooks are added for the lower keys. This was obviously a problem that Harper wished the student to confront. The first phrase of the first lesson for use of the slide ends with a  $d$ . Harper, *Instructions*, p. 20.

11. Sir Henry Bishop, "Thine For Ever," arranged for voice, trumpet and pianoforte by Thomas Harper (London: Stanley Lucas, Weber & Co., nd).

*Andante Sostenuto .* *Chevalier Neukomm .*

Nº 19.  
in E♭.

*Allegretto Moderato assai .*

Nº 20.  
in E♭.

(T.Harper's Instructions for the Trumpet)

### Example 1

Thomas Harper, *Instructions for the Trumpet*, p. 25.  
(Note the musical flexibility provided by the slide tones).

# Thine For Ever

Trumpet obbligato (excerpt)

Sir Henry Bishop

arranged by Thomas Harper, Sr.

Trumpet in D

Allegro

4

10

17

22

27

32

*f*

*p*

*ff*

*tr*

## Example 2

*Thine For Ever*

(Note the conservative use of slide tones in Measures 23 through 28).

expectations of his audience. Predictably, Harper's descriptions of embellishments follow Baroque practice and he details aspects of articulation. The use of soft syllables like "gu" and "gong" on strong agogic accent points shows a sophisticated concept of note grouping that is also a Baroque inheritance.

The evidence from the limitations of the instrument itself and Harper's arranging for the slide trumpet suggests that Harper was more conservative in writing for the slide instrument than the etudes in his method would imply; that the slide was still seen as an insurance policy against unpleasant notes in the harmonic series and that audiences (and perhaps the performers themselves) were more interested in hearing the idiomatic lines based on the harmonic series performed precisely rather than in developing and extending the instrument to a new kind of soprano trombone. In any case, the invention and subsequent marketing of the keyed bugle and cornopean made the further development of the instrument unnecessary. Harper's son continued to perform on the slide trumpet, which was manufactured in England until the 1890s, when the valved F trumpet began to take over as the instrument of choice for orchestral playing.<sup>12</sup>

John Bernard Logier, a Frenchman living in Dublin, was really the first to see the new commercial potential of the keyed bugle for providing an alternative timbre to ensembles and for giving a new soprano and alto voice to the increasingly popular bands. Logier operated a music saloon, conducted military bands and developed a scandalous method for teaching group piano that got him into ethical hot water with most of the major musical figures of his day. He also may have stolen the patent rights for the keyed bugle from its inventor, Joseph Haliday, in order to sell keyed bugles to the military. While writers who have researched Logier have alluded to his unethical business practices and his Machiavellian use of his colleagues, almost none have questioned his taste or musicianship. His tutor, *Logier's Instructions to the Art of Playing the Royal Kent Bugle...* was highly influential, being copied, in some cases verbatim, in the United States. It was a student of Logier's, Richard Willis, who reportedly introduced the keyed bugle to the United States.<sup>13</sup>

There are at least three editions of Logier's tutor. The first was published in 1813 in Dublin. Later, a revised edition with a fingering chart for the new nine-keyed Concert

---

12. Modern natural trumpeters could take note of both the elder and junior Harper's success in the Baroque repertoire with the slide trumpet. A revival of this instrument could prove interesting. Granted, its use is anachronistic by 40 or 50 years, but no more so than some generic gambas which are sometimes a hundred years off the dates of the music that they are performing. The slide instrument has much to recommend itself. The current reproductions of the English slide trumpets are based on real instruments that did exist and not 20th century vented adaptations that can be broken down to fit in a gig bag. They are closer to Baroque ideals of timbre and balance than most other reproductions and they have more crooking and tuning possibilities which are needed for the period instrument movement's increased attention to the Classic and early 19th-century repertoire.

13. Logier, *Logier's Instructions to the Art of Playing the Royal Kent Bugle...* p. 5.

Bugle was released in 1823 by Clementi and Company, and finally, an edition was published by R. Cocks around 1835. Logier, being a businessman, tried to get as much mileage as possible out of his product. His fingering charts can even be found in German catalogs.

Logier's book is dedicated to the Duke of Kent, who was the head of all the military, including all military bands. It was probably to appeal to this market that Logier offered military discounts and made the claim that he was the sole owner of the patent and warned of instruments that "may be offered for sale by any fraudulent manufacturer."<sup>14</sup> Logier's dedication extended to the instruments that he had produced for sale to the military. His marketing strategy is the main reason that there are so many "Royal Patent Kent Bugle" inscriptions on the early instruments. The inventor of the instrument was a loyal Irishman who was deeply offended by this dedication and fought what he considered the theft of his patent rights to his grave.<sup>15</sup>

Logier's language, when compared to Hyde and Harper, is extravagant and flowery. For example:

A good *Artist* may produce almost *incredible* effects; for not being confined to any *particular key* or *sounds* as in the Common bugle, he is at liberty, either to traverse the *mazes of harmony* in flights of fancy and modulation, or to *execute passages* with a *rapidity* almost *inconceivable*. Later on the same page: "...the Kent Bugle will always be found a ready and obedient servant. ... The simplicity of its construction, and the consequent facility with such a knowledge of it may be aquired, must also be an encouragement to whoever may wish to study it, as an instrument of Amusement, and render it particularly acceptable to those Amateurs who reside in the Country and are attached to Field or Water Music, as it is very admirably qualified, in both cases, to provide delightful effects."<sup>16</sup>

Earlier, Logier mentions the keyed bugle's effectiveness in military bands, orchestras, theaters and as a solo instrument. Obviously, there is a degree of hard sell going into this discourse, but there are some telling comments. For example, Logier sees the instrument as appealing to an amateur market. This is a new concept. In past centuries, the soprano brass had been performed by the elite professional. Logier's description of the tone of the keyed bugle is also a break with tradition. He indicates that the instrument has registers similar to the human voice from "B-natural below, to G. resembling the voice of a fine tenor; from G upwards, that of a sweet female voice; yet with all this delightful and pleasing variety, the instrument never loses the characteristics of a

14. Ibid.

15. For details of the feud between Haliday and Logier, see Ralph Dudgeon, "Joseph Haliday, Inventor of the Keyed Bugle," *American Musical Instrument Society Journal*, Vol. IX, 1983, p. 53-67.

16. Logier, *Instructions*, p. 2 (preface).

Bugle.”<sup>17</sup> Logier says that the mellow tone, the most important feature of the keyed bugle, is reinforced by a conical mouthpiece similar to the ones used by horn players. This goes against the advice of both Hyde and Harper, who advocated keeping the same trumpet-style mouthpiece for both instruments. The preference for the conical mouthpiece is continued by almost all the post-Logier writers and soon became the sound ideal of most of the keyed bugle virtuosos of the 19th century. Logier included a “Great Exercise” meant to demonstrate the power of the keyed bugle. While it may not exactly “traverse the mazes of harmony in flights of fancy and modulation,” it certainly does prove that the keyed bugle is capable of moving through some secondary dominant chord changes with relative ease (Ex. 3). Furthermore, the material in the tutors for keyed bugles seems to match the music that the instrument actually performed more than the etudes and tunes provided in the slide trumpet instruction books.

The writers of tutors after Logier basically expanded his concept of the keyed bugle as a versatile, mellow-toned, cantabile instrument. In the years that followed, interest in the use of added keys increased, and the later methods are useful because they document these additions. The addition of a seventh key gave the instrument a solid E-flat (which could also be produced on a six-key instrument by some tricky alternate fingerings). The eighth and ninth key were added to insure good trill combinations on all the notes. Later, U.S. makers added up to 12 keys to the instrument for similar reasons. The tutors give almost no mention of the high E-flat keyed bugles that became popular in the United States. Some of the methods are useful because they have illustrations of the extra keys and give evidence of national styles of instrument design. The French tutors have illustrations of Halary’s modified instruments, which eliminated the pigtail B-flat crook on English keyed bugles, resulting in a slightly larger instrument that had no option to be played in C.

The transition from the keyed bugle to the cornopean can be illustrated by the career of George Macfarlane. Macfarlane had played the keyed bugle and arranged a large collection of solos for the keyed bugle and piano.<sup>18</sup> This collection is notable for its use of the keyed bugle in unusual keys such as B natural in his arrangement of “Air and Variations from Cinderella.” Macfarlane is most noted, however, for his *The Cornopean Instructor*, and for the invention of the Macfarlane clapper key, a device for producing trills on the cornopean. His book documents the use of crooks and slides for playing cornopeans in many keys. Macfarlane’s tutor also serves as an example of the change in practices of ornamentation. The trills begin to be shown as starting on the note and proceeding to the upper or lower neighbor, instead of following the earlier practice of starting on the upper neighbor on the beat as specified by Harper and most of the keyed bugle authors. Macfarlane also abandons the subtle articulations mentioned by Harper. He gives “Ta” as the only necessary syllable.

---

17. Ibid.

18. George Macfarlane, manuscript in the Bate Collection, Oxford, England.

## The Great Exercise

“...showing the great power of the Kent Bugle”

John Bernard Logier

♩. 80 then increase tempo

The musical score is written on five staves in treble clef, 2/4 time. It begins with a tempo marking '♩. 80 then increase tempo'. The first staff contains the first three measures, followed by a slur. The second staff contains the next three measures, also with a slur. The third staff contains three measures with a slur. The fourth staff contains three measures with a slur. The fifth staff contains the final three measures, ending with a double bar line. The key signature changes from one flat (B-flat) to one sharp (F-sharp) across the staves.

### Example 2

Logier's *Grand Exercise*

In conclusion, the following considerations are worthy of note:

1. The keyed bugle and subsequent cornepean methods were aimed at a new audience of amateurs as well as the traditional professional and military players, marking a break with previous social status of trumpeters and expanding the market for the new publications and instruments.

2. The ornamentation practices outlined in the keyed bugle tutors stayed in the Baroque style until the cornepean methods begin to document trills starting on the written note.

3. Mouthpieces changed from the trumpet-style to the conical cup in the keyed bugle era. The conical bugle simply sounded better with a horn-like mouthpiece. The bright clarity of the clarino playing contrasted with the middle-register mellow characteristics of the keyed bugle more sharply than the cornet and trumpet sound of today. The polarity of trumpet and the keyed bugle's sound ideals marks the beginning of the splitting of the trumpet and cornet parts in the 19th-century orchestra, characterized by the trumpet's idiomatic fanfare writing versus the lyric and chromatic use of the cornet.

4. Although full chromaticism was possible on keyed bugles, a number of crooking options taken from the earlier trumpet practices were employed to make the music easier to perform. Crooking practices were continued in the cornepean technique.

5. The sound ideal changed radically as the keyed bugle gained in popularity. The darker, mellow quality probably influenced the construction and performance practice of early cornepeans and cornets by placing a high value on this new timbre. The high E-flat instrument modified this concept of timbre, but the ideal remained a mellow quality of sound with a rich fundamental in its harmonic content.

As reproductions of slide trumpets and keyed brass become available and scholars begin to take this era of brass instrument history more seriously, there will be an increased attention to the details of performance practice as outlined by the methods and other contemporary material. The keyed brass era, although brief, was a fascinating time marked by innovation, imagination and a surprising tie to tradition.

*Ralph Dudgeon is a noted virtuoso on the keyed bugle and expert on 19th-century brass music. He is an Associate Professor of Music at SUNY at Cortland and is co-editor at Spring Tree Enterprises publications.*